

TEMPLATE 3 – OTM-R Checklist

Case number: 2021BG606909

Name Organisation under review: Medical University of Varna “Prof. Dr. Paraskev Stoyanov” (MUV)

Organisation’s contact details: 55 Marin Drinov Street, Varna 9002, Bulgaria; telephone: +359 52677050

SUBMISSION DATE: 25.03.2022

DATE ENDORSEMENT CHARTER AND CODE: 04.02.2021

OTM-R Checklist

A specific self-assessment checklist is provided for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment (OTM-R). Please report on the status of achievement, also detail on the indicators and the form of measurement used.

| OTM-R checklist for organisations | | | | | |
|--|-------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|---|--|
| | Open | Trans- parent | Merit- based | Answer: ++ Yes, <i>completely</i> +/-Yes, <i>substantially</i> -/+ Yes, <i>partially</i> -- No | *Suggested indicators (or form of measurement) |
| OTM-R system | | | | | |
| 1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)? | x | x | x | +/+ | <ul style="list-style-type: none">Act on Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria |

| | | | | | |
|--|---|---|---|-----|---|
| | | | | | <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/pravilnici%202021/act_on_development_acadStaff_022019.pdf</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University “Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov” – Varna/ Last update – amended and supplemented on 28.01.2021, in force from 28.01.2021 (Protocol No 14/28.01.2021) <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Act on the promotion of Scientific Research <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/ACRO/Pages/dokumenti-acro.aspx</p> |
| 2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions? | x | x | x | +/- | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University “Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov”; Last update – amended and supplemented on 28.01.2021, in force from 28.01.2021 (Protocol No 14/28.01.2021) <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regulations on the Institutional Implementation of the EC Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers at the Medical University of Varna, 2016 <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/en-pravilnici/Regulations-implementation-European%20Charter%20for%20Researchers.pdf</p> |
| 3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R? | x | x | x | +/- | <p>The staff has knowledge of the main principles in the area of OTM-R and the members of the selection committees are qualified to perform OTM-R recruitment. Representatives of the Human Resource department and a representative of the legal department of MUV are involved in each</p> |

| | | | | | |
|--|---|---|--|-----|--|
| | | | | | <p>selection procedure. OTM-R training programmes exist for younger staff, e.g. PhD students. Examples of courses held:</p> <p>1) „Managing biomedical research on complex questions in small research environments“;</p> <p>2) „Opportunities and programs for mobility and development of PhD students, postdoctoral students, graduates and young scientists.</p> <p>Internal educational programme for more senior academic staff involved in the recruitment of researchers at MUV is to be developed.</p> |
| 4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools? | x | x | | +/- | <p>Legal documents and algorithms are published on the MUV's website to inform and guide the candidates on the specific procedures for acquiring degrees and applying for academic positions. Appointment guidelines of the Research Institute provide detailed information on the application and appointment procedures for each specific research position. Regulations on the development of academic staff and accredited programmes at MUV are published at our website:</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/polezna-info-karieri</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/AboutUs/Pages/%D0%9D%D0%B0-%D0%9C%D0%B5%D0%B4%D0%B8%D1%86%D0%B8%D0%BD%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%B8-%D1%83%D0%BD%D0%B8%D0%B2%D0%B5%D1%80%D1%81%D0%B8.aspx</p> <p>Open positions are advertised at:</p> <p>- MUV's website: https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Pages/konkursi.aspx</p> <p>- State gazette: https://dv.parliament.bg/DVWeb/registerDV.faces, and</p> <p>- daily newspapers https://sites.google.com/site/vestnicite/nacionalni-izednevni</p> |

| | | | | | |
|--|---|---|---|-----|--|
| | | | | | <p>An electronic platform for online application for academic positions and doctoral programs is under development within a project „<i>Creating of a multidisciplinary educational environment for development of specialists with integral competencies in biomedicine and health care</i>“.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/InternationalActivity/Pages/multidisciplinarna-sreda.aspx</p> <p>In COVID times we actively use online communication methods in the recruitment process, such as WebEx platform, Blackboard platform, telephone conferences and other e-tools, following the established rules and regulations.</p> |
| 5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place? | x | x | x | +/+ | <p>The application documents submitted by the candidates are checked by the Admission Committee. Candidates are evaluated by a scientific jury, the members of which are appointed for each specific procedure. Each member of the scientific jury presents a review /opinion for the candidates' application.</p> <p>The information about each procedure is sent to the National Center for Information and Documentation in the Ministry of Education and Science, where access and control is provided at a national level https://ras.nacid.bg/competitions</p> <p>The rules and procedures are published at MUV's website: http://intra.mu-varna.bg/web/intranet/%D0%9F%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%B8%D0%BB%D0%B0-%D0%BF%D1%80%D0%BE%D1%86%D0%B5%D0%B4%D1%83%D1%80%D0%B8-%D0%B8-%D0%B4%D1%80%D1%83%D0%B3%D0%B8?inheritRedirect=trueThe%20successful%20candidates%20are%20approved%20by%20the%20Faculty%20and%20Academic%20Councils</p> |

| | | | | | |
|--|---|---|---|-----|--|
| | | | | | The successful candidates are approved by the Faculty and Academic Councils. |
| 6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply? | x | x | x | +/+ | <p>Open positions for doctoral students and academic staff are published in the State Gazette, on the website of the National Center for Information and Documentation, on the website of MU-Varna and in the Regional edition of the national daily newspapers. They are visible and any candidate who meets the criteria for the specific position may apply and be selected based on merits. The procedures are open to both internal and external to MU-Varna candidates.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Pages/konkursi.aspx https://ras.nacid.bg/competitions https://dv.parliament.bg/DVWeb/registerDV.faces https://sites.google.com/site/vestnicite/nacionalni-ezednevni</p> <p>A trend towards an increase in the share of applicants from outside the organization has been established during the last years and currently their share at MUV is about 3,7%.</p> |
| 7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad? | x | x | x | +/- | <p>The information on job vacancies and the recruitment policy of MUV is public and it is in line with the EU policies to attract the most qualified and perspective researchers, but submitted applications from candidates from abroad are still scarce. As a result, the share of foreign researchers or researchers coming from abroad (applying or appointed) is still very low at MUV, although their number is consistently increasing in the last decade. More positions should be advertised on international websites and platforms for recruitment of researchers. All vacancies should be published at EURAXESS. Changes at national level politics to stimulate research and science innovations are expected to increase the share of Bulgarian and foreign researchers coming to MUV from abroad. Currently they consist about 1.5% from all the researchers in the university.</p> |
| 8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups? | x | x | x | +/+ | <p>The provisions of the Law on protection against discrimination are observed at MUV. The university provides equal rights for all candidates and for all its researchers - equal opportunities and gender equality.</p> |

| | | | | | |
|--|---|---|---|-----|--|
| | | | | | Gender and age diversity are achieved and stay stable and the trend to appoint applicants among women stays high in the last 10 years. |
| 9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers? | x | x | x | +/- | <p>MUV offers attractive working environment for its researchers providing access to up-to-date research infrastructure, including clinical settings for research and innovations development. The Research Institute provides expertise and guidance, access to scientific laboratories, vivarium, tools and research platforms. Mobility programmes, trainings and participation in scientific events are stimulated, support to open publishing is provided. By decision of the Academic Council of MUV from 22.02.2016 (Minutes № 59 / 22.02.2016) Regulations on the Intellectual Property Management, Regulations on the Institutional Implementation of the EC Code of Conduct for the Recruitment of Researchers, Regulations on the Commercialization and Transfer of Research Results at MUV were adopted.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/dokumenti-acro</p> <p>A decision of the Academic Council from 03.12.2021r (Minutes №37/ AC, adopts a Methodology for a distribution of funds for additional remuneration for authorship and co-authorship of scientific publications in journals, referenced or indexed in world databases.</p> <p>We aim to accentuate on possibilities for part-time work, sabbatical and flexible working time for MUV researchers in our action plan to be in line with the C&C and the principles of OTM-R policy. These, along with the recently introduced with regard to the COVID pandemics home office, will improve the conformity and balance between work and family life for MUV's researchers and will further increase the attractiveness of the university for applicants from outside the organization.</p> |
| 10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply? | | | | +/- | <p>The selection of job candidates is carried out by scientific committees, which include internal and external to MU-Varna members. These committees are selected amongst a nationally approved pool of distinguished scientist from the same scientific field, based on the suggestions from the department announcing the vacancy and approved by the Faculty Councils. There is an archive with documentation of all procedures for academic positions at MUV. The vacant positions are announced publicly and every potentially</p> |

| | | | | | |
|--|---|---|--|-----|--|
| | | | | | <p>interested candidate is able to apply. There are no means to control whether most suitable candidates apply but we have procedures to ensure that most suitable candidates among the applicants are selected in accordance with national regulations and in line with those of the C&C and OTM-R principles that are adopted at MUV. Our goal is to modify internal procedures and regulations so that all C&C and OTM-R principles are met at MUV.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Pages/Degrees.aspx</p> |
| Advertising and application phase | | | | | |
| 11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions? | x | x | | +/+ | <p>Academic and research job advertisements are standardized with the specification of the field of higher education, the professional field, the specialty, the faculty, the department and the teaching sector. Additional requirements are also to be mentioned, if any. The guidelines are in line with the Act on Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria and with the MUV internal regulations. The same template is followed in the job announcements in English language, when such are published.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Pages/konkursi.aspx</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/AboutUs/Pages/transten-job.aspx</p> |
| 12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit? | x | x | | +/+ | <p>The job advertisements contain information on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the institution announcing the vacancies • the title of the position, professional field and specialty, starting date and terms; • the career profiles of potential researcher applicants (R1-R4) with the corresponding obligatory and required competences; • selection criteria, including education and professional experience, procedure details; • number of vacancies available; • working conditions, workplace; • opportunities for professional development. • the application procedure and the deadlines; • contact details. |

| | | | | | |
|--|---|---|--|-----|---|
| | | | | | <p>The applicants may find all the information about the workplace and staff, research activities etc. of the unit announcing the vacancy on the MUV's website in Bulgarian and in English languages, continuously updated and extremely detailed.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg https://www.mu-varna.bg/EN</p> |
| 13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience? | x | x | | -/- | <p>We do not publish job postings on EURAXESS for now, but we aim to regulate this during the revision of the internal procedures. Nevertheless, our other channels to announce job vacancies allow potential external candidates to be informed and to apply and thus in the last two years we have appointed new researchers from abroad. Native Bulgarian language speaking candidates from outside MUV or from abroad have access to all the vacancy announcements and all related information through the established informational channels.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/AboutUs/Pages/transten-job.aspx</p> |
| 14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools? | x | x | | -/+ | <p>The academic and research job vacancies are published in the State Gazette, on the website of MU-Varna, in the Regional edition of a national daily newspaper, and in the National Center for Information and Documentation. Recently we have adopted a policy to use also other job advertising tools, such as EURAXESS and Research gate, and especially now during the COVID pandemics – also social networks (Facebook, LinkedIn etc.). We have plans to start regular posting in EURAXESS and research networks and these changes will be included in the internal MUV recruitment procedures.</p> |
| 15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate? | x | | | +/+ | <p>The administrative burden is reduced to a minimum. Applicants do not provide original documents as a proof for their qualification, instead they present only certified for fidelity copies of the documents. All supporting documents may be submitted electronically. A platform for electronic submission of all required for job applications documents is under development at MUV. A procedure for the recognition of the qualifications of foreign candidates is specified in Section VII - Procedure for recognition of PhD and doctor of science degrees</p> |

| | | | | | |
|---|--|---|---|-----|---|
| | | | | | <p>acquired abroad and Section V -Procedure for holding the academic positions of head assistant professor, associate professor and professor by persons who have acquired the respective positions in other higher education institutions or scientific organizations of the Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University “Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov”; Last update – amended and supplemented on 28.01.2021, in force from 28.01.2021 (Protocol No 14/28.01.2021).</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/normativni-dokumenti-karieri</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf</p> <p>All applicants receive a letter (in person or by e-mail), notifying them whether they are admitted or not to participate in the competition, based on the provided application package of documents and correspondence to the position. The letter specifies all next stages of the procedure (Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University “Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov”; Last update – amended and supplemented on 28.01.2021, in force from 28.01.2021 (Protocol No 14/28.01.2021) Article 4, para.6</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf</p> |
| Selection and evaluation phase | | | | | |
| 16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees? | | x | x | +/+ | As described above, there are clear rules for the composition of the selection committees, stated in the national legislation and the institutional regulations. The committees/scientific juries are appointed after being approved by the Faculty Councils and based on an order of the rector of MUV for participation in the scientific jury (for submission of a review or of an evidence based written opinion). External members sign a contract with MUV for performing a service. Jury members are |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|---|---|-----|---|
| | | | | | paid and the payments are determined by a decision of the Academic Council (order №R-100-173 / 23.06.2011) and in the Internal rules for the salary of MUV's staff. All these regulations are strictly followed in all appointment procedures of MUV and we do not have complaints with this regard from failed unsuccessful candidates in the last 5 years. 100% of all scientific committees have been comprised following these principles. |
| 17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees? | | x | x | +/+ | <p>Committees/Scientific Juries consist of members who declare no conflict of interests and the decisions they take are objective and evidence-based. The committees consist of at least five members, both external and internal to MUV, with a career and a professorship in the professional field of the specific competition, registered in the Register of Academic staff and defended dissertations of the National Information and Documentation Centre.</p> <p>Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University "Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov"; Last update – amended and supplemented on 28.01.2021, in force from 28.01.2021 (Protocol No 14/28.01.2021) – Article 4, Art. 5, Article 6: https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/normativni-dokumenti-karieri</p> |

| <p>18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?</p> | | x | x | +/+ | <p style="text-align: center;">GENDER RATIO OF THE SCIENTIFIC COMMITTEES AT MUV</p> <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <thead> <tr> <th>Year</th> <th>Men</th> <th>Women</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>2016</td> <td>271</td> <td>280</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2017</td> <td>222</td> <td>250</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2018</td> <td>396</td> <td>380</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2019</td> <td>245</td> <td>359</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2020</td> <td>307</td> <td>477</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>The composition of the scientific committees includes researchers with a professorship from both sexes - men and women. Gender balance, although not explicitly mentioned in the regulatory documents, by presumption and as a tradition in the Bulgarian academic and research settings is taken into account, where possible. Analyzes of the gender balance in the appointed by MUV scientific juries throughout the years reveal a slight predominance in the favor of women, which represents also the gender ratio at the institution. We aim at developing our own Equal Opportunity Policy document where these aspects with regard to HRS4R will be incorporated.</p> | Year | Men | Women | 2016 | 271 | 280 | 2017 | 222 | 250 | 2018 | 396 | 380 | 2019 | 245 | 359 | 2020 | 307 | 477 |
|---|-----|-------|---|-----|---|------|-----|-------|------|-----|-----|------|-----|-----|------|-----|-----|------|-----|-----|------|-----|-----|
| Year | Men | Women | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2016 | 271 | 280 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2017 | 222 | 250 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2018 | 396 | 380 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2019 | 245 | 359 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2020 | 307 | 477 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <p>19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected?</p> | | | x | +/+ | <p>There are clear written guidelines on the rules of scientific committee selection, described in the Act on Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria, in the Regulations on the application of the Act on Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria, and the Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University "Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov".</p> | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | | | | |
|--|--|---|-----|---|
| | | | | https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/normativni-dokumenti-karieri |
| Appointment phase | | | | |
| 20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process? | | x | +/+ | <p>In line with the Act on Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria, all applicants are informed whether they are approved or not for the research position that they have applied for. At the end of a procedure the candidates, both successful ones and those who had not been approved or did not pass the exams, are informed by a written notice about the outcome of the competition in a letter by the mail, in due terms specified in the written guidelines.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/pravilnici%202021/act_on_development_acadStaff_022019.pdf</p> <p>Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University "Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov", Art. 120, para. 4, Art. 132, para. 4, Article 144(5):</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf</p> |
| 21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees? | | x | +/- | <p>Each candidate is provided with a written notice on the outcome of the competition and we provide general feedback and details on the candidate's performance on site when examination is involved or on request, by other communication channels, in case of document-based decisions.</p> <p>Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University "Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov", Art. 120, para. 4, Art. 132, para. 4, Article 144(5)</p> |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|---|--|-----|--|
| | | | | | https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf |
| 22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place? | | x | | -/+ | <p>According to the selection procedure rules https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf any candidate is free to submit a written complaint with regard to appointment decisions and procedure outcomes. The complaints are considered by the Rector and the legal department of the university (Regulations on the Academic Staff Development at Medical University “Prof. Dr. P. Stoyanov” Art. 103, para. 5.)</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/EN_%D0%9F%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%A1.pdf</p> <p>No complaints with regard of appointment decisions and procedure outcomes have been received during the previous years in MUV. Nevertheless, an independent of the university government institution (e.g. ombudsperson) is envisaged in the Action plan to be created and it is meant to deal with complains and provide independent advice to MUV researchers and research applicants in line with the C&C principles and OTM-R policy.</p> <p>Act on Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria, Chapter four describes the roles of the ethics committees in this respect</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/pravilnici%202021/act_on_development_acadStaff_022019.pdf</p> <p>The Ethics Committee at MUV acts in agreement with the above legal document.</p> |

| | | | | |
|--|--|--|-----|---|
| | | | | <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/keni/Pravilnik_KENI_MUV_27.09.2018.pdf</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/AboutUs/Documents/pravilnici%202018/81%20%D0%9F%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%B8%D0%BB%D0%BD%D0%B8%D0%BA%20%D0%B7%D0%B0%20%D0%BA%D0%BE%D0%BC%D0%B8%D1%81%D0%B8%D1%8F%D1%82%D0%B0%20%D0%BF%D0%BE%20%D0%B5%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%BA%D0%B0%2018.06.2018.pdf</p> <p>The Action plan envisages to develop rules/a procedure, describing complaints mechanism.</p> |
| Overall assessment | | | | |
| 23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives? | | | +/- | <p>We do not have a specific system in MUV for evaluation of OTM-R, but through other rules and regulations of MU-Varna, we can exercise control.</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/AboutUs/Pages/pravilnici_MU-Varna.aspx</p> <p>Act on Development of the Academic Staff in the Republic of Bulgaria</p> <p>https://www.mu-varna.bg/BG/Research/Documents/pravilnici%202021/act_on_development_acadStaff_022019.pdf</p> <p>Regular surveys contribute to get an objective feedback from our applicants and academic staff. The involvement of the Academic staff in the governing bodies of the university allow for the procedures and rules timely update when necessary.</p> |